



By [Fraser B. Barnes](#), MBA, CMC, DMC  
The Art of Collaborative Assessment & Selection

## Improving Job Candidate Evaluation & Selection

You don't have to be an HR manager for a Fortune 100 company to appreciate the challenges in evaluating, comparing and selecting job candidate. Setting meaningful criteria, organizing evaluation and selecting the best job candidate or recruit is often frustrating and time consuming. How do you create meaningful criteria that everyone can agree on and interpret similarly, make sense of the feedback received and then try to compare job candidates / potential recruits so that you make the best selection, is difficult at the best of times. However, with a little preparation and the use of best practices in evaluation and selection, the task will become much less daunting and much more informative.

Developing a standardized evaluation (rating & ranking) and selection framework that enables staff members to assess a job candidate or potential recruit on multiple attributes and facilitates comparisons makes the task less taxing and improves the quality and transparency of an employee selection process. Below is an example of a job candidate evaluation framework which can be used in conjunction with software applications such as the one offered by ProGrid Evaluation Solutions. Together they can bring greater objectivity, transparency and consistency and to your job candidate evaluation process and significantly improve your candidate / recruitment selection process.

**A word of warning** before you bound off to implement a standardized evaluation & selection framework. As [Susan M. Heathfield](#) describes in her popular [human resources](#) series on [About.com](#) , "Your Guide to Human Resources", systematizing your process for hiring employees, is the first and most vital step to recruiting or hiring a superior workforce. Read [Susan's checklist](#) for setting up and systematizing your hiring or recruitment process.

### Implementing an Effective Job Candidate Evaluation & Selection Framework:

- 1) Make a list of the requirements you expect the right job candidate to possess. Note any specific qualifications, attributes or technical skills as these will combine to form your evaluation and selection criteria and later support high impact visual representations of the results.
- 2) Group these requirements into similar categories or "criteria themes". For example, public speaking skills, ability to work in teams and awareness of own strengths and weaknesses might be put under a theme of Interpersonal Skills.
- 3) Cross-check the logic in getting what you want by placing your job candidate evaluation criteria themes under three columns, Credentials, Enablers and Impact, in that order as shown in the example below.

CANDIDATE ATTRIBUTES	ENABLERS	IMPACT ON ORGANIZATION
Education / Training	Time Management	Developing Others
Work Experience	Interpersonal Skills	Customer Service
Technical / Management Skills	Supervising & Leadership	Innovation / Improving

- 4) For each criteria theme, write one to three sentences that capture the most important and differentiating aspects for it. Hint: look at items from the list you created in step 1 that you grouped under the criteria theme.
- 5) Create candidate evaluation criteria using the format below or your own. If you design your own, evaluation best practices suggest that your grading scale for each criteria theme should have an even numbers of choices as shown in the example below. This helps differentiate job candidates as it forces evaluators away from going for 'safe' or lazy ground in the center. You also need to assign a value to each level on your grading scale. This is done to convert your more explicit levels of performance into metrics so you can calculate a total for each job candidate, rank and compare. It's best not to show the assigned value on your evaluation form. Note: this is not the same as criteria weighting. Weighting your criteria is not used here and is not recommended...unless of course you have an academically validated econometric model for selecting the best job candidates or recruits. See List of Sample Job Candidate Evaluation Criteria at the end of this article.

### **Technical Skills**

The candidate demonstrated to your satisfaction that he/she has the necessary technical skills to perform the job successfully.

- \_\_\_\_\_ Does not meet requirements.
- \_\_\_\_\_ Meets some but not all requirements.
- \_\_\_\_\_ Meets requirements.
- \_\_\_\_\_ Exceeds requirements.

- 6) Create an evaluation form using the evaluation criteria themes you developed in step 5. Use the form in interviews or for job candidate / recruitment selection committees. If you share questions and responsibility across interviewers or committee members, you will learn more about the job candidate or recruit and the individual will not suffer the same interview questions repeatedly. Try giving the same form to the candidate or recruit and asking them to assess her or him self and justify their answers to each criteria. You will also discover whether the job candidate "fits" your organization by fostering a discussion on a criterion by criterion basis. Hint: focus only on the criteria where scores (ratings) differ across interviewers or committee members.
- 7) Collect the evaluation forms and tabulate the results for each job candidate or potential recruit. Alternatively, [ProGrid Evaluation Solutions](http://www.progrid.info/evaluationtools/Hiring_an_Employee_v1.0.1.exe) offers a quick and [rating and ranking evaluation tool](#) informative you can download and use for free at: [http://www.progrid.info/evaluationtools/Hiring\\_an\\_Employee\\_v1.0.1.exe](http://www.progrid.info/evaluationtools/Hiring_an_Employee_v1.0.1.exe).
- 8) To best facilitate job candidate selection assessment and decision making, chart the results on a graph. – See [sample report](#) produced by the [rating and ranking evaluation tool](#) mentioned above.
- 9) Keep your results as they can greatly assist the hired job candidate or recruit, their supervisor and Human Resources in understanding which areas the individual needs to strengthen their capabilities.

Implementing a standardized evaluation and selection framework like the one described above, will help you and your organization's staff members assess job candidates and potential recruits faster, more objectively and transparently. It will also provide you with specific, actionable and meaningful results that will help differentiate job candidates/potential recruits, focus discussion on areas of concern instead of wasting time chatting about what everyone agrees on. Once

implemented, you can rely on it to support and document your decisions and as a basis for performance or 360° reviews.

## Sample Job Evaluation Criteria

---

### Candidate Attributes

**Education / Training** – Based on the reference material submitted and/or the interview, the candidate...

- A. Requires significant additional education and/or training to perform the job successfully.
- B. Needs a little more education and/or training to perform the job successfully.
- C. Possesses the necessary education and/or training to perform the job successfully.
- D. Has outstanding education and/or training qualifications to perform the job successfully.

**Work Experience** - Experience relevant to the job's tasks & responsibilities and industry knowledge necessary to perform the job successfully, the Candidate has:

- A. Minimal experience performing tasks, effecting responsibility and/or industry knowledge.
- B. Some experience performing tasks, effecting responsibility and industry knowledge.
- C. Significant experience performing tasks, effecting responsibility and industry knowledge.
- D. ...And has made major contributions in relevant past positions.

**Technical / Management Skills** – Technical and management skills necessary to perform the job safely, appropriately and successfully, the Candidate has:

- A. Few of the skills to perform the job safely, appropriately and/or successfully but requires substantial training.
- B. Some of the skills to perform the job safely, appropriately and successfully, requiring some additional training.
- C. All of the skills to perform the job safely, appropriately and successfully.
- D. Outstanding set of relevant skills that will greatly increase the contribution and/or performance of the position.

### Activities/Enablers

**Time Management** – The ability to manage time independently and efficiently by prioritizing, scheduling and completing tasks on time, the candidate has:

- A. Minimal ability to manage time independently or efficiently.
- B. Some ability to manage time independently or efficiently.
- C. An ability to manage time independently and efficiently.
- D. An exceptional ability to manage time independently and efficiently.

**Interpersonal Skills** – Interpersonal skills necessary to perform the job successfully, the Candidate has:

- A. Limited ability to articulate ideas clearly, actively listen and use the appropriate body language necessary.
- B. Some ability to articulate ideas clearly, actively listen and use the appropriate body language necessary.
- C. Excellent ability to articulate ideas clearly, actively listen and use appropriate body language necessary.
- D. Outstanding ability to articulate ideas clearly, actively listen and use appropriate body language, e.g. a role model.

**Supervising & Leadership** – Leading, supervising and assisting others in performing their job successfully, the Candidate has:

- A. Minimal experience necessary and/or limited leadership potential.
- B. Some supervisory experience necessary and leadership potential.
- C. Significant supervisory experience necessary and good leadership potential.
- D. Exceptional supervisory experience and excelling leadership.

**ADDITIONAL SAMPLE CRITERIA FOR THIS CATEGORY (THEME):**

**Problem Solving** – Ability to design innovative solutions and solve problems or handle unexpected events, the Candidate has:

- A. Minimal experience and capability necessary for the position.
- B. Some experience and capability necessary for the position.
- C. Significant experience and capability necessary for the position.
- D. ...**That** has repeatedly resulted in a major contribution or positive impact.

**Team Work** – Ability, experience and demonstrated desire to work toward team goals and through collective action to add value to the organization, the Candidate has:

- A. Minimal ability, experience and demonstrated desire.
- B. Some ability, experience and demonstrated desire.
- C. Excellent ability, experience and demonstrated desire.
- D. ...**AND** has contributed exception value to the organization and team members.

**Impact on Organization**

**Developing Others** – Assisting and mentoring others, helping them to further develop their careers and add value to the organization, the Candidate has:

- A. Minimal training, experience and enthusiasm.
- B. Some training, experience and enthusiasm.
- C. Excellent training, experience and enthusiasm.
- D. Exceptional training, experience and enthusiasm.

**Customer Service** – Assisting and interacting with customers necessary to perform the job successfully, the Candidate has:

- A. Minimal experience, talent and attitude to be customer-focused.
- B. Some experience, talent and attitude to be customer-focused.
- C. Strong experience, talent and attitude to be customer-focused.
- D. Outstanding experience, talent and attitude to be customer-focused, above what is expected to perform the job successfully.

**Innovation / Improvement** – Innovation and continuous improvement necessary to respond to competitive pressure and trends, the Candidate has:

- A. Limited awareness of the importance of innovation and need for continuous improvement in all areas of an organization.
- B. Some awareness of the importance of innovation and need for continuous improvement in all areas of an organization.
- C. A strong awareness of the importance of innovation and need for continuous improvement in all areas of an organization.
- D. Outstanding awareness of the importance of innovation and need for continuous improvement in all areas of an organization.

**ADDITIONAL SAMPLE CRITERIA FOR THIS CATEGORY (THEME):**

**Adds Strategic Value** – The importance of adding long-term value and aligning personal & organizational goals, the Candidate has:

- A. Limited awareness or understanding.
- B. Some awareness or understanding.
- C. A strong awareness or understanding.
- D. ...**And** has made major contributions resulting in additional long-term value personally and for the organization.